

# Quality Enhancement Grant Scheme

Final Evaluation Report

Project No. : 20/QEGS/2011

## Part A

Project Title : Outcome-based Approach in Student Peer Mentoring Scheme 學長啟導計劃

Name of Grantee : Vocational Training Council

Project Period : From September 2011 (month/year) to August 2013 (month/year)

## Part B

Please use separate A4-size sheets to provide an evaluation of the Project with regard to the following aspects:

1. Project activities contributing to the attainment of Project objectives, extent of attainment of the objectives, evidence or indicators attesting to the attainment of the objectives, and if applicable, reasons for not able to achieve the objectives.
2. Impact or benefits of the Project to the participants, the target institution(s) or the sector.
3. Cost-effectiveness of the Project against clear indicators, e.g. utilization of available resources, unit cost per beneficiaries, sustainability of Project activities/impacts, applicability of Project outcomes/deliverables to other institutions, or alternative approaches for equivalent benefits at less cost, etc.
4. Outcomes and deliverables of the Project.

Signature: \_\_\_\_\_

Organisation

Chop: \_\_\_\_\_



Name of Authorised

Person: Mrs TO LAU Deanna

Name of Grantee Vocational Training Council

Organisation:

Position of Authorised Assistant

Person: Executive Director

Date: 05 DEC 2013

# Quality Enhancement Grant Scheme

## Final Evaluation Report on Outcome-based Approach in Student Peer Mentoring Scheme (Reporting Period: 9/2011 – 8/2013)

### 1 Introduction

1.1 The Quality Enhancement Grant Scheme of Education Bureau has granted funding support to Vocational Training Council (VTC) to launch the Student Peer Mentoring Scheme (SPMS) under Outcome-based Approach for students of self-financing Higher Diploma programmes. The Scheme was implemented by the Student Development Discipline Office (SDDO) with support from various operational units in VTC, over the period from September 2011 to August 2013.

This final evaluation report provides information and analyses on the outcomes and effectiveness of the Scheme.

1.2 The Scheme was implemented with the aim to achieve the following objectives:

- To develop a framework of outcome-based learning approach and application to student learning and development programmes in educational setting;
- To build a learning community culture within campuses through promoting learning and sharing;
- To equip students with the skills and proper learning attitudes to enhance their whole person development experience and to become a self-directed person and life-long learner;
- To empower students to appreciate, take initiative and take ownership of their learning experience through engaging in development, review and consolidation of their learning



# Quality Enhancement Grant Scheme

## 2 Scheme Features

2.1 The Outcome-based Approach adopted in Student Peer Mentoring Scheme (SPMS) aims to hone students' attitudes, values and learning skills with the help of sustained trainings and coaching. To meet the challenges of increasing demand on graduate attributes in the employment market and the worldwide trend towards applying an outcome-based approach to teaching and learning, the scheme adopts Outcome-Based Education (OBE) framework for facilitating the students' learning and development process. At the end, it is hoped that students could become the owner of learning so as to maximize their potential and achieve the learning outcomes through peer support. The scheme was characterized by the following features :

- To adopt OBE systematically as the framework in the design, delivery and evaluation of the Student Peer Mentoring Scheme;
- To empower students to take ownership of their learning experience by learning the OBE approach through implementation of a self-initiated group project. Students will learn to develop statements of what they know, understand and are able to do on completion of their learning process. In addition, they will use assessment rubrics to measure and report their project achievement;
- To facilitate students' learning and personal development by specially designed training materials and regular individual or group feedback;
- To demonstrate students' learning achievements, acquisition of skills and competence through organizing project presentation day and/or sharing session.

## 3. Cost-effectiveness

3.1 The estimated target of students for this 2- year project is 1,960 student mentees and mentors for 2 cohorts. By completion of the project, a total of 2,032 student mentees and mentors would have completed 27 community projects. In addition, an active and supportive learning culture was established and sustained among 9 IVE campuses and the Hong Kong Design Institute.

3.2 This project was approved with expenditure of HK\$ 1,726,000 and the actual expenditure accrued was HK\$ 1,471,680.35 with a saving of HK\$ 254,319.65. Details of the expenditure with breakdown are provided in the Financial Report.

# Quality Enhancement Grant Scheme

## 4. Attainment of Objectives

Objective statement	Activities related to the objective	Extent of attainment of the objective	Evidence or indicators of having achieved the objective
1) To develop a framework of outcome-based learning approach and application to student learning and development programmes in educational setting	- Staff training on outcome-based approach, project management and coaching skills	Fully achieved	- 136 staff have completed the training and are able to make use of rubrics to advise students on achieving better performances with intended learning outcomes
2) To build an active and supportive learning culture within campuses through promoting learning and sharing	- Recruitment of student mentees and mentors in 2 cohorts	Fully achieved	- An active learning culture was cultivated and sustained through facilitating regular peer mentoring sessions. In the first cohort AY 11/12, 210 mentees and 112 mentors were recruited while in AY 12/13, 1,260 mentees and 450 mentors participated in the scheme
3) To equip students with the skills and proper learning attitudes to enhance their whole person development experience and to become a self-directed person and life-long learner	- Training workshops and camps for student mentors and mentees	Fully achieved	- A total of 2,613 mentors and mentees have completed 16 sessions of workshops or trainings in outcome-based approach, collaborative problem solving, leadership skills and learning motivation
4) To empower students to appreciate, take initiative and acquire ownership of their learning process through engaging in the development, review and consolidation of their learning experience	- Students in groups took initiation to design, implement and evaluate their community projects	Fully achieved	- A total of 27 group projects completed in 2 cohorts of mentors and mentees - 2 annual project sharings were successfully conducted with more than 500 audiences and guests

# Quality Enhancement Grant Scheme

## 5. Deliverables and Outcomes

● Training to staff coaches on outcome-based approach and coaching skills	
Descriptions of the deliverables	Outcomes
<p><b><u>18 November 2011</u></b></p> <p>40 staff from Student Development Offices (SDO) of the 9 IVE campuses and the Hong Kong Design Institute have participated in full-day training.</p>	<p>Staff coaches were able to formulate intended learning outcomes (ILOs) for learning experience and design assessment rubrics for assessing learning outcomes.</p>
<p><b><u>4, 8, 14 &amp; 15 December 2012</u></b></p> <p>5 staff coaches have completed a training programme organized by the Hong Kong Student Services Association (HKSSA) to get familiarized with the latest knowledge and development of student services.</p>	<p>Staff coaches were equipped with skills in facilitating students in community project management.</p>
<p><b><u>6 January 2012</u></b></p> <p>35 SDO staff members have completed a training workshop on project management skills.</p>	<p>Staff were equipped with coaching skills including “Mirroring” and “Presence” that can be used for both individual or group coaching provided to students.</p>
<p><b><u>9 &amp; 16 January 2013</u></b></p> <p>25 SDO staff have completed 2 sessions of training on coaching skills.</p>	<p>Staff coaches were able to employ a more systematic framework in conducting individual and group coaching.</p>
<p><b><u>26 February &amp; 5 March 2013</u></b></p> <p>20 SDO staff have participated in a workshop on social service coaching skills.</p>	<p>The training further equipped staff coaches with coaching skills to enhance students’ performance</p>

# Quality Enhancement Grant Scheme

	through coaching.
<p><b><u>14-17 August 2013</u></b></p> <p>11 staff coaches have completed a 4- day certification programme on Myers-Briggs Type Indicator (MBTI) which is one of the most widely used personality tool in understanding personality types.</p>	Staff coaches were able to employ a psychometric tool in guiding students in self-understanding.
<p>● <b>Training to students mentors and mentees on mentoring role and skills, community project management skills and other trainings which are relevant to their learning needs</b></p>	
<b>Descriptions of the deliverables</b>	<b>Outcomes</b>
<p><b><u>September 2011 - October 2011 (AY 11/12)</u></b> <b><u>September 2012 - October 2012 (AY 12/13)</u></b></p> <p>Recruitment of mentors and mentees were conducted in 2 cohorts. The first cohort for AY 11/12 peer mentoring scheme has recruited 112 mentors and 210 student mentees while the second cohort for AY 12/13 has recruited 450 mentors and 1,260 mentees.</p> <p>The recruitments were conducted among 9 Hong Kong Institute of Vocational Education (IVE) campuses and the Hong Kong Design Institute (HKDI). Interviews were conducted to clarify expectations of the students. Later, orientations for both mentors and mentees were held to let them know more about the project.</p>	<p>A total of 562 student mentors and 1,470 student mentees had benefitted from this programme. An active and supportive culture was cultivated and sustained through the peer mentoring effect.</p>
<p><b><u>29 October 2011 &amp; 10 November 2012</u></b></p> <p>Two Kick-off ceremonies of the Peer Mentoring Scheme were held for AY 11/12 and AY 12/13 cohorts. Professor Edmond KO, the Director of Center for Engineering Education Innovation of HKUST, officiated the first kick-off ceremony on 29 October</p>	<p>Student mentees were able to gain a clear understanding of the outcome-based approach in the peer mentoring scheme.</p>

# Quality Enhancement Grant Scheme

<p>2011 and shared his experience on outcome based education. The second kick-off on 10 November 2012 was officiated by the Academic Director of Student Development Discipline of the Vocational Training Council.</p>	
<p><b><u>29 October 2011</u></b></p> <p>A workshop on learning skills was held with 155 mentees and 100 mentors' participation. The use of the value-expectancy model in motivating learning was introduced with some practical exercises.</p>	<p>Student mentors and mentees were able to identify factors which enhanced learning motivations and could be put into practice in their community projects implementations.</p>
<p><b><u>18 February 2012</u></b></p> <p>116 mentees and 83 mentors have completed a workshop on project management in which teamwork, collaborative problem solving and project management skills were discussed and practiced.</p>	<p>Students were equipped with essential skills in project management, which provided a solid foundation for implementing their community project in the next stage.</p>
<p><b><u>February 2012 – March 2012</u></b></p> <p>250 mentees have participated in three leadership training camps with the facilitation of 112 mentors and 2 staff coaches, in areas of understanding on social enterprises, effective communication and presentation skills as well as strategies for study tours design.</p>	<p>The trainings enhanced the teambuilding work of mentees in project management, while the mentor-mentee relationship was further strengthened.</p>
<p><b><u>10 March 2012 &amp; 5 May 2013</u></b></p> <p>Two half-day training workshops for 112 student mentors on project facilitation skills were conducted so that mentors could provide effective guidance and coaching to student mentees in the community project delivery.</p>	<p>Student mentors gained more confidence with the help of these programmes.</p>

# Quality Enhancement Grant Scheme

<p><b><u>8, 23 November 2012 &amp; 24 January 2013</u></b></p> <p>A series of three training workshops were conducted with 500 mentors and mentees to enhance their understanding of the macro world development including world exploration and mental health.</p>	
<p><b><u>16-30 November and 1 December 2012</u></b></p> <p>30 mentors and 150 mentees have participated in the Open Days in different IVE campuses and exhibition booths were set up to introduce outcome-based learning approaches to the campuses.</p>	<p>Students were able to practise their teamwork, problem-solving and presentation skills in the campus events.</p>
<p><b><u>20 November 2012</u></b></p> <p>A workshop on outcome-based education (OBE) was organized to familiarize mentees with OBE concepts and a total of 31 mentors and 136 mentees had participated in the programme.</p>	<p>Students were able to practise their learnt skills in the process.</p>
<p><b><u>27 November 2012 &amp; 4 December 2012</u></b></p> <p>84 mentors and 272 mentees have completed a workshop on collaborative problem solving on 27 November 2012 and a workshop on project management on 4 December 2012. The purpose of the trainings was to facilitate mentees project planning and effective communication between mentors and mentees.</p>	<p>Students were able to transfer their learnt problem-solving skills in their design and implementation of the community group projects.</p>
<p><b><u>24 January 2013</u></b></p> <p>42 mentors and 140 mentees have completed a workshop on student centered learning approach. They were familiarized with some assessment approaches, which allowed them to design assessment rubrics for self-learning and self-assessment.</p>	<p>Students have developed themselves to be goal-oriented and self-regulated learners.</p>



# Quality Enhancement Grant Scheme

<p><b><u>26-27 January 2013</u></b></p> <p>A mentee training camp was organized by 60 student mentors with 180 mentees participants. This programme served dual training purposes – for mentees to develop their problem-solving and teamwork skills and for mentors to practise their problem solving and teamwork skills.</p>	<p>Student mentors treasured the opportunities to demonstrate their learning and competence in an authentic event.</p>
<p><b><u>6 February 2013</u></b></p> <p>Workshop on memory skills was organized with 60 participants. The theme was not only limited to memory skills but also to expand students' perspectives and horizon in thinking.</p>	<p>The training enabled students to be creative in problem solving and project implementation.</p>
<p>● <b>Community projects to be designed and implemented by students mentees with the support of student mentors and staff coaches</b></p>	
<p><b>Descriptions of the deliverables</b></p>	<p><b>Outcomes</b></p>
<p><b><u>February 2012 – May 2012</u></b></p> <p>A total 13 self-initiated community group projects were implemented by the students of AY 11/12 cohort. They are able to demonstrate their learning through the planning, implementation and evaluation of a wide variety of community projects under the facilitation of student mentors and staff coaches.</p> <p>The 13 group projects were in various themes with highlights of the projects attached in <i>Annex 1</i>.</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>- LOVE projects (by 3 groups)</li> <li>- Walk the Fun City Hunt project</li> <li>- Anna + Jack Project</li> <li>- Project on “Respect”</li> <li>- Community Life project</li> <li>- Show Your Love project</li> </ul>	<p>Student mentors and mentees supported each other in the process through providing feedback not only on project improvements but also on personal development.</p> <p>The implementation of the projects also served the purpose of promoting outcome-based learning.</p>

# Quality Enhancement Grant Scheme

<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>- SIMs project</li> <li>- Project on "Understanding property developer hegemony"</li> <li>- Draw Something Heart project</li> <li>- Project on "No barriers in communication"</li> <li>- Project on "Effect of virtual communication"</li> </ul>	<p>Positive feedback was received from many guests. They witnessed students' learning process and personal growth through their project presentations.</p>
<p><b><u>March 2013</u></b></p> <p>A total of 14 community group projects were organized by the cohort in AY 12/13 with highlights of the projects attached in <i>Annex I</i>.</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>- Organizing overnight camp</li> <li>- Organizing a seminar on workplace conflicts and solutions</li> <li>- City Hunt</li> <li>- Environmental conservation guided tour</li> <li>- Happy Farm</li> <li>- Candy Rush</li> <li>- Seminar on increasing effectiveness</li> <li>- City Hunt in wild</li> <li>- Campus orientation</li> <li>- Environmental protection workshop</li> <li>- Challenging Team</li> <li>- Egg Hunter</li> <li>- Treasure Hunter</li> <li>- Running Man</li> </ul>	<p>The project implementation was facilitated by the student mentors who tried to transfer their learning experience to the mentees. The mentoring process not only helped the mentors to revisit and practice the outcome-based learning approach but also sustained the active and supportive learning culture.</p>
<p><b><u>6 July 2013</u></b></p> <p>A sharing session was held in IVE in which the 14 groups set up booths and presented their project</p>	<p>The guests were impressed by students' performance and convinced of the learning impact</p>

# Quality Enhancement Grant Scheme

learning to 350 guests including VTC staff, students, employers and community members.	on the student mentors and mentees.
--	-------------------------------------

5.1 In sum, the project has achieved its intended objectives at two levels:

- At student level – equip students with proper learning skills and attitudes to become a self-directed and self-regulated learner who will actively engage in the learning process which include planning, regular review and reflection to enhance their performance and personal development.
- At project level – develop a framework for student development programme using outcome based approach in which student performances were guided with self-designed learning statements and assessed by self-designed rubrics. Moreover, an active and supportive learning culture was cultivated through the mentoring process.
- The two annual project sharing events – the presentation of the AY 11/12 cohort on 12 July 2012 and the presentation of the AY 12/13 cohort on 6 July 2013 were good evidence to demonstrate the success of this project. Each project group set up a booth and was able to present their learning achievement confidently to some 550 guests of staff, students, employers and other visitors from the community.
- In addition to evaluating the effectiveness of the peer mentoring scheme, the Student Development Discipline Office has invited Dr. WONG Wai-ning Kris, the Associate Professor of the Faculty of Technology and Science at The Higher and Educational Institute, to conduct a survey to assess the improvements of students participating in the scheme. The survey has adopted a quantitative approach and the results have indicated that the peer mentoring participating students have demonstrated more independent, with a sense of autonomy, self-regulation, as well as better interpersonal competency after going through the Student Peer Monitoring Scheme. Details of the survey were attached in Annex 2.

## 6. Difficulties Encountered and Solutions Adopted

- One of the limitations of the scheme was time constraint in mentors training and practicing mentoring skills. There were 2-3 training workshops each academic year provided to mentors on mentoring role and skills as well as project management, but these trainings could only provide a basic or fundamental concept on mentoring. Mentors were in need of a more in-depth training and experiential learning in order to better performing their mentoring duties. More guidance from the staff coaches are needed to provide good support to student mentors.

# Quality Enhancement Grant Scheme

- Another challenge of this project was the high demand in staff coaching to better support both student mentors and mentees for giving feedback and facilitating reflection on their learning experience. Given the limited time and manpower for the staff coaches, group coaching or group debriefing were employed. But it is more desirable that individual coaching could be used in some cases.

## 7. Conclusions

- This 2-year Student Peer Mentoring Scheme aimed to hone students' attitudes, values and learning skills with sustained training and coaching. In contrast to the traditional student programmes, this learning and development programme adopted the outcome-based approach in its design, delivery and evaluation as well as student-centred learning where students took ownership in their learning. The active and supportive learning culture was sustained through the peer mentoring effect.
- The smooth implementations of the 27 student community projects during the reporting 2 years, the 2 successful annual sharings on the project learning held on 12 July 2012 and 6 July 2013 to more than 500 audience and the evaluation survey by Dr Kris WONG have pointed out the effectiveness of this project in contributing to students' whole person development by using an outcome-based approach in student development programme. Because of its proven effectiveness, this outcome-based peer mentoring scheme has become a recurrent student programme among the 9 IVE campuses and the Hong Kong Design Institute and will continue in the coming academic years.